‘O Paumakua / ‘O Kaulu / Kai Wawā ka Moku

An Essay by Kīhei de Silva

Haku mele: Poepoe identifies the haku mele of “Paumakua” as Kaleikuahulu or Kalanikuahulu (J.M. Poepoe, “Moolelo Hawaii Kahiko,” *Ka Nai Aupuni*, August 22 and 25, 1906). The haku mele of “Kaulu” and “Kai Wawā” are not known to us.

Sources: The three chant fragments are recorded and translated by Abraham Fornander in *An Account of the Polynesian Race*, II: 25, 13, and 15. Other older but more recently rediscovered sources, are given below.

Our text: As given in Fornander’s *Account* with orthographic editing and translations by Kīhei de Silva.

Our competition mele is actually a three-chant presentation of “‘O Paumakua Ka Lani O Moenaimua,” “‘O Kaulu Nei Au,” and “Kai Wawā Ka Moku.” All three chants were published by Abraham Fornander in 1878 and are, in fact, fragments of longer, presumably-lost compositions.[1] Together these fragments celebrate the accomplishments of Paumakua and Kaulu and offer a haunting picture of the waters on which the two must have sailed. These voyaging chiefs are especially important to us because they are both from our Kailua home and were among the ancestral guardians, eight centuries later, of our own Kailua navigator Kaleomanu‘iwa Wong as he steered the *Hōkūle‘a* across the Atlantic from South Africa to Brazil. We also find these mele significant because they describe early voyages away from Hawai‘i – journeys across sighing, multi-colored oceans to the Pillars of Kahiki and back. This is quite different from several more widely known chants (Kamahualele’s “Eia Hawai‘i” and Mokuakaumana’s “E Lonokaeho,” for example) which deal with journeys to Hawai‘i from southern points of origin.

E hoi e noho ia Hawaii-kuauli
He aina loaa i ka moana
I hoea mai loko o ka ale
I ka halehale poipu of Kanaloa

Return with us and dwell in green-clad Hawaii
A land discovered in the ocean
That rises up amidst the waves
Midst the swamping breakers of Kanaloa[2]

It is also likely that the chants we present are from a time – perhaps the 10th or 11th centuries A.D. – that slightly precedes the much larger canon of voyaging mele and mo‘olelo that originate with Pa‘ao’s arrival in Hawai‘i, continue with the round-trip excursions of Moikeha, Olopana, and Kila, and conclude with the departure from Kualoa of La‘amaikahiki. Where chants of the later voyaging canon frequently describe Hawai‘i as appearing out of the ocean off the bows of royal, double-hulled canoes, the Paumakua and Kaulu chants describe journeys through distant regions, many unrecognizable today, that were visited, left behind, and never seen again. Where many of the later chants convey a sense of elation at having reached a final destination, our

chants seem to express a sense of adventure and exploration. Simply put, the later chants say "We have arrived," and the earlier chants say "We have seen."

Fornander identifies the "Oahu Paumakua" as a child of Lonoho'onewa, the son of Newalani who, in turn, descended from the Puna branch of the Ulu line of southern chiefs. Fornander contends that the Paumakuas of this branch, as opposed to the "Maui Paumakuas" of the Hema branch of the same line, were probably here at the time of Newalani, which makes them contemporaries of the grandparents of Kapawa, the last Nana-line chief of Hawai'i who was succeeded by Pili and Pa'ao, southerners regarded by Fornander as having initiated the second migratory period of our history. Fornander's theory of migration (two distinct waves, the Marquesans in the 6th century and the Tahitians in the 12th) has since been challenged by those who argue for a more complex history of settlement,[3] but his genealogical reckoning indicates that Paumakua's kupuna kāne Newalani had arrived, settled, and become a grandparent here by the time of Pili; it is therefore a reckoning that nibbles at the edges of Fornander's own hypothesis.

Fornander informs us that the subject of our first chant fragment "was born on Oahu at Kuaaohe, in Kailua, Koolaupoko, that he died on Oahu, and he was buried at Iao on Maui."[4] Mo'olelo surrounding Paumakua begin with his father's brother Kahanoanewa who "stretched out his hands to the farthest bounds of Kahiki, and on them came the Menehune people to Oahu."[5] Kailua was among the places to which these menehune were assigned, "and it is said that they were... employed to build the heiaus of Mauiki, Kaheiki, Kawaewae, Eku, Kamoalii, and Kuaokala." Although Ulupō, probably the oldest and most important of the heiau ringing Kawainui Pond in Kailua, is not mentioned in this list, other traditions clearly identify our māpele as the work of "menehunes, and as usual, with stones brought from long distances passed from hand to hand."[6]

Mo'olelo referring to Paumakua himself describe the extent of his travels to distant lands. He is said to have circled Kahiki ("ka'apuni Kahiki"); in other words, he sailed as far and wide as Hawaiians thought it possible to sail. In one of these mo'olelo, he is reported to have returned from a voyage with two white men, the priests Auakahinu and Auakamea,[7] who were later renamed Kaekae and Maliu, and from whom a line of O'ahu priests traces its descent. On that same voyage, Paumakua is also supposed to have returned with a prophet named Malela, "but whether the latter was also a white man, the tradition is not so explicit."[8] The two priests, described as "ka haole nui, maka alohilohi, ke a aholehole, maka aa, ka puaa keokeo nui, maka ulaula" ("foreigners of large stature, bright sparkling eyes, white cheeks, roguish, staring eyes, large white hogs with reddish faces") have been the subject of considerable modern speculation: who were these haole, and how far did Paumakua sail to discover them?[9]

Kamakau, in *Ke Aupuni Mō'ī*, offers a somewhat different explanation of the arrival in Hawai'i of the first haole. He says they arrived by ship at Mōkapu, Ko'olaupoko in the time of Paumakua's grandfather Auanini: they were Ulupau (ke kapena), Malaea (ka wahine), and several others whose names are familiar today (Olomana, Aniani, and Holomakani).[10] As for Paumakua himself:

> ʻO Paumakua ke aliʻi o Oʻahu, ka moʻopuna ia a ʻAuanini. Ua kaulana ia aliʻi no ka holo e kaʻapuni i nā ʻāina ʻo Kūkuluokahiki, a nāna i lawe mai kānaka liʻiliʻi, he kupaliʻi, akā, ma kona moʻolelo ka mimilo kai ʻo Manowai-kaioʻo (mimilo ke ʻano). He mau kāhuna pule kekahi i lawe ʻia mai. ʻO Kaʻekaʻe, ʻo Maliu, a me Malela. Aia ma ka ʻoihana pule a kēia poʻe kāhuna pule, ua like ke ʻano me ka poʻe Iudaio, a ua like nā kapu.
>
> Paumakua was the aliʻi of Oʻahu, the grandchild of ʻAuanini. He was famous for circumnavigating the lands of Kūkuluokahiki, and it is he who brought back the little people, the diminutive ones, but his story [also includes his encounter with] the maelstrom Manowai-kaioʻo (whose nature was that of a whirlpool). He also returned with some priests: Kaʻekaʻe, Maliu, and Malela. The religious practices and kapu of these priests were similar to those of the Judaeans.[11]

A third variation of this story has Paumakua returning from foreign voyages with three haole: Kukahauula, Kukalepa, and Haina Pole, the last a woman. Fornander, however, is adamant in discrediting this account as an "embellishment...promiscuously ascribed" by the descendants of the late-arriving Hema line to their own less distinguished ancestor of the same name.[12]

Fornander also mentions "another Hawaiian legend" that attributes to Paumakua the introduction of circumcision to the Hawaiian Islands. Fornander qualifies his already offhand comment with the observation that this custom was almost universally practiced by the "Polynesian tribes," that it was probably practiced from the very beginnings of our history, and that, if anything, Paumakua "probably only renewed or enforced the ancient practice."[13] Nathaniel Emerson also touches on the subject ("The introduction of circumcision is by some ascribed to Paumakua"[14]), but neither provides enough information for us to identify their source or sources.

Aside from his reputation as an explorer, his return with nā puaʻa keʻokeʻo nui, and his disputed claim to the introduction of circumcision, little is known of Paumakua's reign or influence. It is generally held that Kumukaha and Moenaimua were his sons, although some genealogies exclude Moenaimua completely while others make Moenaimua the son and Kumukaha the grandson. It is clear (at least in Fornander's eyes) that Paumakua was the ancestor, four generations removed, of Laʻamaikahiki, "a chief from whom every succeeding generation of chief took a special pride in claiming descent."[15] Laʻamaikahiki, who was adopted by Moikeha of the original Maweke line of chiefs that traced its descent back to the earliest days of Oʻahu's settlement, thus represents the point at which the Paumakua line merges with both the earlier line and with the last of our celebrated voyaging chiefs.

A final, unexpected, discussion of Paumakua's legacy occurs in Joseph Poepoe's 1908-9 telling of "Ka Moolelo Kaao o Hiiaka-i-ka-Poli-o-Pele." Poepoe describes the sleep during which Pele is summoned to Kauaʻi by the sweet sounds of the pahu paʻi lima, the pūniu, and the oeoe o nā leo hula. He interrupts his story to explain that Paumakua was the voyaging chief responsible for bringing this hula pahu kāʻeke (hula danced to the drumming of pahu) to Hawaiʻi.[16] He further identifies Paumakua as the aliʻi for whom the mele "'O Paumakua ka lani o Moenaimua" was composed. He explains that this is the Oʻahu Paumakua, not the Maui Paumakua, that both were here in 1060 A.D., and that the Oʻahu Puamakua's voyage to Kahiki and back came before the migration of Pele and her family to our islands.

> Ia Pele i hiamoe ai, ua lohe aku la kona uhane i ke kani mai a kekahi mau pahu pa‘i lima maoli, oia hoi, ka pahu kaeke i oleloia i ke au kahiko; a oe-oe pu maila hoi na leo hula. Kuokuolo mai la ke kani o na pahu, a puia koekoele ae la hoi ka leo o na wahi puniu e hooka‘uka‘ulele ia ana e na niau...
>
> Ano, e ka makamaka heluhelu, ua oleloia ma ka moolelo o Paumakua, oia ke alii o Hawaii nei i hoi mai mailoko mai o kukulu o Kahiki i lawe mua mai i ka hula kaeke i Hawaii nei; aka, ma keia mahele o ka moolelo o Hiiaka, i loaa mai ko Maui Hiiaka mai, e kala wale no keia hula kaeke i loaa ai i Hawaii nei. A ina he oiaio, o ka wa mua ia i laha mua ai keia i Hawaii nei ma ka manawa ia i hoea mai o Paumakua, ke Alii nona ka oleloia ana: “O Paumakua ka lani o Moenaimua / O ke alii nana i hele ke Kahiki...”
>
> Alaila, he hope mai ko Pele ma pae ana mai i Hawaii nei; he mua aku ko Paumakua hoi ana mai, mai Kahiki mai, ka wa a ka Moolelo Hawaii e olelo nei, na Paumakua i lawe mai i ka hula kaeke i Hawaii nei.[17]
>
> Aka ua ikeia ma ka Moolelo kahiko o Hawaii nei he elua mau Paumakua, oia hoi, ko Maui Paumakua ame ko Oahu nei Paumakua; a o laua a i elua, aia no ko laua manawa i ikeia ai ma ko Hawaiia nei Moolelo ma ka M.H. 1060. He mea maopopo, ke hope mai keia mau Pauakua a he mua loa aku no o Pele...”[18]

The Paumakua chant-fragment that we present in this year’s Merrie Monarch Festival refers, then, to the O‘ahu chief of perhaps the 11th century, to his son Moenaimua, to his journey to Kahiki on the broad, open ocean, and to his return with the treasured “fish” – Auakahinu and Auakamea – that were caught in his net.

> ‘O Paumakua, ka lani o Moenaimua,
> ‘O ke ali‘i nāna i hele ke [*sic*] Kahiki,
> A Kahiki i ke kai ākea,
> ‘O mimo, ‘o momi, ‘o ka māmio,
> ‘O ka i‘a mai loko, ‘o ka ‘Auakahinu,
> ‘O ‘Auakamea ia lani.
>
> Paumakua is the lord of Moenaimua,
> He is the chief who went to Kahiki,
> To Kahiki in the open sea,
> The swift-moving, the precious, the quickly-departing[19]
> The fish from within were ‘Auakahinu
> And ‘Auakamea, the noble.[20]

While Paumakua is by no means a figure around whom one can find a wealth of information, he does occupy a definite place in our mo‘olelo and mo‘okū‘auhau. Kaulu, the subject of our second chant fragment, is far more difficult to pin down. We know that his full name is Kaulu-a-kalana, that there are threads of semi-historical traditions associated with him, and that there is also a

body of "marvelous deed" story-telling to which he is connected. Samuel Kamakau addresses this issue in 1866 when he writes:

> Ua olelo ia pau loa o loko o Kahiki ia ia, ua ike oia i na aupuni a pau o ka honua, a ua ike oia i ka mimilo o Moanawaikaioo, nana no i lawe mai ka lepo ai o Kawainui, aia ma kana mele i kau ai...ma Kailua Koolaupoko ko Kaulu aina hanau, ma kona moolelo, a me kona kaao, ua oiaio kekahi, a ua wahahee kekahi. Aka, ua kaulana ko Kaulu kaao i hele ai i Kahiki.
>
> It is said that everything in Kahiki was known to [Kaulu]; he saw all the nations of the world; he encountered the maelstrom of Moanawaikaioo, it was he who brought here the edible mud of Kawainui; it is all recorded in his mele... Kailua, Koʻolaupoko was Kaulu's birth land; as regards his moʻolelo and kaʻao, some are true and others are lies. But the kaʻao of Kaulu's going to Kahiki has become famous.[21]

Kamakau also identifies Kaulu as "he umikumamalima hanauna mai a Welaahilaninui mai" (15 generations from Welaahilaninui, the grandfather of Wakea and the original ancestor of our chiefly lines),[22] but his name does not appear at this point in any of the chiefly genealogies that we have consulted. As a result, we are still unsure of his place in the genealogies and his exact chiefly status. Fornander, who is the most detailed of Kaulu's biographers, reports that he lived in Kailua, Oʻahu, that he might have belonged to the Ulu line of chiefs, that he is remembered as a famous seafaring chief of the early voyaging period, and that he is referred to in several moʻolelo of this period as a contemporary of Moikeha, Luhaukapawa, and other prominent persons of both lines.[23] In a later section of Fornander's *Account*, he offers this somewhat more specific explanation of Kaulu's relation to Luhaukapawa:

> [Luhaukapawa] was the "kilo-kilo," astrologer, navigator, and priest of Kaulu-a-kalana, the famous Oahu chief who visited so many foreign lands, and who is said to have been the grandson of Hinaikapaikua, the wife of Nanamaoa, and consequently contemporary with the Paumakuas and with the children of Maweke. What southern group was his birthplace is not known, but he returned with Kaulu-a-kalana to Oahu and settled there. Some legends attribute to Luhaukapawa, in a general way, the introduction of the tabus; but it is probable that he only enforced their stricter observance, and perhaps added some new regulations previously unknown to, or not in use among, the Hawaiians.[24]

Beyond Fornander's account, information regarding a "'real" Kaulu is scattered and brief. Beckwith repeats Fornander's suggestion that Kaulu might be the grandson of Nanamoa and Hina-the-tapa-beater (these are probably variations of Fornander's Nanamaoa and Hinakapaikua); she notes that Nanamoa is thought to have been one of the Ulu chiefs and that Hina is a descendant of the mythical trickster Maui-a-kalana. Beckwith also notes that Kaulu is sometimes said to have married Kekele (the calm and handsome woman of Kailua whose name was given to the fragrant hala grove she planted at the base of Nuʻuanu Pali), but Beckwith concludes, as we have, that these names do not show up in meaningful ways in any of the known chiefly genealogies.[25]

Many later sources repeat the story that Kaulu returned from one of his voyages with the edible mud – lepo ʻai or lepo ʻai ʻia – of Kawainui Pond. It is said that in later times, divers were sent into the pond to procure the haupia-like substance. As long as a kapu of silence was observed during these endeavors, the divers' safety and the availability of the food were not jeopardized. It is reported that lepo ʻai ʻia was eaten as recently as the time of Kamehameha I: during a stay in Kailua (some say at a time when food was scarce – or when Kamehameha's warriors had eaten everything else at hand), the chief's stewards were sent to Kawainui where they gathered the mud in calabashes.[26] Several of these more-or-less second-hand, 20th-century accounts of lepo ʻai ʻia are given below:

> The "lepo ai ia," or edible mud, was found only in Kawainui pond at Kailua, Oahu. It was thick and jelly like, like haupia pudding. A strict kapu was imposed when one dived to get it. No one was allowed to utter a word while the diver was in the pond getting it. If a word was spoken, ordinary mud rose up around the diver and covered him so that he died. There was no escape.[27]

> Ulu, also called Kaulu, was a chief born in Kailua, Koolau after the time of Wakea. He traveled to Oahu from the pillars of Kahiki and on his return brought this lepo ai ia to his birthplace...There too in Kailua is a place called Kaulu for this chief.[28]

> Here also was found the "lepo ai ia," or a certain kind of mud that resembled haupia pudding in texture but had the color of poi. It was brought by Kaulu-a-kalana and put in the pond."[29]

These accounts might be viewed as merely fanciful were it not for an article published by J.B. Keliikanakaole in an 1872 issue of the *Nupepa Kuokoa*:

> Moe Kaoo I Ka Ai Lepo. — Ma ka hope o na la hooluolu kino o ka makou kamalei Mrs. B. Pauahi Bishop, ma kona wahi hooluolu kino ma Hanakamalaelae, Heeia, Koolaupoko, ua naue kumaka aku la oia a me Mrs. Likelike Cleghorn, e ike pono i ka lepo ai ia o ka loko o Kawainui i Kailua, a, ua moe kaoo o ka laua huakai. Oiai na wai o na ao e iho makolukolu mai ana, e kau ana laua ma ka waa, a e luu ia ana ka lepo; ua ai ua mau milimili la a me ke kini o Kailua mano Kaneohe a me Heeia a ko-u ka puu. Ua malamaia ka paina me ka maikai, a o ka mea hilu o na umeke lauhala i ulana loeaia e na wahine. O keia ano o keia lepo, he haulaula kikokiko, he nakanaka e like me ka pia; a, o ka ono, e ua like me ka pia i hoomoaia, a he pahee i ka puu ke moni aku. He 8 paha kapuai mai luna o ka wai a i lalo kahi i waiho ai o ua lepo nei. He elua mea ano kup[a]naha e loheia nei ma keia Loko o Kawainui, o ua lepo nei, a o ka laau onaia e ka ia (Makalei) oia ka ka mea i nui ai ka ia oia loko. No ka ai ole paha o Kailua ko ke Akua hana ana i keia lepo?
>
> Mounting an excursion to eat mud. — On the last days of the respite of our princess Mrs. B. Pauahi Bishop at her retreat at Hanakamalaelae, Heʻeia, Koʻolaupoko, she and Mrs. Likelike Cleghorn went to experience first-hand the edible mud of Kawainui Pond in Kailua, and for this they mounted an excursion. While water from the clouds fell heavily, the two entered a canoe, and the lepo was dived for and was then eaten by the cherished women and the people of Kini Kailua, Mano Kāneʻohe, and Heʻeia as well, and their

> throats clucked [they ate heartily until satisfied]. The feast was nicely presented, and especially elegant were the lauhala bowls expertly woven by the women. The nature of this mud is that it is pink-speckled with a gelatinous texture similar to pia [arrowroot starch used, for example, in haupia]; as for its taste, it is like cooked pia and very smooth to the throat when swallowed. The place where this mud is found is perhaps 8 feet below the surface of the water. There are two wondrous things associated with this Kawainui Fishpond: this edible mud and the fish-attracting branch (the Mākālei) that increased the number of fish in the pond. Was it because Kailua had no food that God made this mud?[30]

Although Keliikanakaole does not attribute the mud to Kaulu, he leaves little doubt that it was still known, dived-for, and enjoyed in the late 19th century.

Less verifiable is Kaulu's encounter with what Kamakau calls "ka mimilo o Moanawaikaioo" – the rippling, revolving whirlpool water of Moanawaikaioo – and for which he provides the following lines of mele:

> Lele ka pinaohaololani lele i ka lani,
> O lele aku keia o Moanawaikaioo—
> O ke aumiki, o ke auka, e mimilo ai,
> E make ai ia oe—
> E lele paha e ku paha.
>
> The acclaimed dragonfly soars in the heavens
> Leaps to Moanawaikaioo
> The outgoing current, the snaring current that sweeps you up
> It has been defeated by you
> Perhaps by leaping, perhaps by staying put.[31]

This adventure is also mentioned by S.B. Dole in "Voyages of the Ancient Hawaiians,"[32] by the unnamed author of "No ka Minamina i ka Moolelo Hawaii no ka nalowale,"[33] by Na-Hau-o-Maihi in "Ka Moolelo Hooni Puuwai no Keakaoku,"[34] and by Martha Beckwith who notes that Emory has compared Kaulu's maelstrom to Tuamotuan stories of canoe-displacing whirlpools.[35] From what we can surmise – and there is very little actual information to surmise from – Kaulu was caught in a whirlpool and deposited safely at some distance from his original foundering point.

The last of the Kaulu traditions that we've been able to discover belongs to a decidedly mythical figure whose fantastic adventures have been interpreted by Beckwith as symbolic of the increasing agricultural independence of the earliest Hawaiians. In this tradition, recorded by Fornander as "The Legend of Kaulu,"[36] Kaulu's parents are identified as Kū-ka-ʻōhia-a-Laka and Hina-ulu-ʻōhiʻa, important forest deities who are, in other legends, usually associated with the hula gods and the Waipiʻo district of Hawaiʻi Island (as in Westervelt's "Keaunini" and "Laukaieie," for example). Kaulu is born in Kailua, Koʻolaupoko, after five year's residence in his mother's womb. He emerges as a piece of rope, is later given human form, and is blessed with a daring temperament and extremely strong hands. In the course of his many escapades, Kaulu robs the gods, drains the sea, persuades Makaliʻi to part with his food-holding nets,

conquers Haumea, kills Lonoka‘eho of the prominent foreheads, defeats the giant dog Kū-ka-‘īlio-loa, and becomes the ruling chief of Ko‘olauloa and Ko‘olaupoko.

Beckwith suggests that all of these adventures, but particularly those involving Makali‘i and Haumea, portray Kaulu as a kind of Hawaiian Prometheus who takes power from the gods and gives to man the ability to fend for himself. Makali‘i loses his nets: the gods no longer control man’s food supply. Haumea – goddess of wild-growing vegetables – is overcome: man no longer needs to rely on gathering his food from the forests; he grows what he needs in patch and pond. *Ka-ulu* itself is a word referring to growth, and Kaulu’s association with Kailua (an early, if not original site of man’s agricultural and aquacultural success in Hawai‘i) is probably more than coincidence.[37]

The fragment of the Kaulu chant that remains with us today names Kaulu as the child of Kalana, praises his skills at casting stones and nets, acknowledges his sea-going, fleet-leading prowess, and catalogs the places he visited on his many and far-reaching voyages. We perform only the first section of this fragment, the lines that identify his father and describe his various skills and attributes. We omit the longer section that lists the multitude of seas on which he sailed and the lands (most of them unrecognizable to us today) to which he journeyed.[38]

‘O Kaulu nei au, ,
‘O ke kama o Kalana
‘O ka hiamoe kapu,
Ka ‘auwa‘alālua
Ke ke‘ele ma‘aalaioa.
‘O ku‘u lei, ‘o pawa,
Ka mea nāna i ho‘olei.
Kaulu ma uka, ē Kaulu ma kai
Ē Kaulu ē, Kīwa‘a ia
Ē Kaulu ē, ‘auwa‘a ia.

I am Kaulu,
The child of Kalana
The sacred sleep,
The fleet of double-sailed canoes[39]
Kaulu the expert sling-thrower.
Rainbow colors, morning light,
He is the one who spreads them out
Kaulu ashore, O Kaulu at sea
O Kaulu, he is the Kīwa‘a[40]
O Kaulu, a canoe fleet is he.[41]

It comes as no surprise that the last of our three fragments also appears in sources that predate Fornander’s *Account of the Polynesian Race*. A modified version of “Kai Wawā ka Moku” is chanted by Lonoikamakahiki in the 1865 mo‘olelo of the same name,[42] and an identical 8-line rendition of the Fornander text is given by Kamakau in 1866 as evidence of our po‘e kahiko’s knowledge of the maelstrom of Norway and of the Black, Red, and Green Seas of the world.[43] In

neither instance, however, are we provided with an understanding of the context of the mele itself or of the voyagers to whom it belonged. For this reason, "Kai Wawā ka Moku," retains a mysterious provenance that is compounded by its own mysterious content: it mentions no voyager chief and it catalogs no island names; instead, it provides us with an impressionist's array of sound, color, movement, and ambiguity. In recording it, Fornander offers two largely unhelpful bits of explanation. He says that it was composed by an "ancient Hawaiian bard" as a description of "foreign regions." And he says that its multi-colored seas are "now hardly possible to determine; but they certainly were beyond the area of the Pacific Ocean, and attest to the distant voyages of the Polynesians of this epoch."[44]

"Kai Wawā" begins with "noisy" and ends with "not very noisy." In between, it describes seas of progressively lighter colors (from lānahu to ʻōmaʻo), hints at a juxtaposition of Kāne and Kū, comes to an absence of motion that somehow includes all motion (not rising, not falling, not sleeping), and leaves us with the vaguely unsettling image of ocean caverns that are either protruding/agitated (*ʻōkū*) or belonging to Kū (*o Kū*).

The ocean is first one thing, but then it is not that thing, and then it is something else; indeed, the ocean is always something on its way to becoming something else. This protean resistance to definition lies at the core of "Kai Wawā." Although we are by no means deep-water sailors; this is what we imagine to be the "constant" of the world of Paumakua, Kaulu, and Kaleomanuʻiwa – the voyaging "birds" who are most prepared for and alert to change, who float over and drink from the ocean's ever-mutable face.

> Kai wawā ka moku
> Kai lānahu ahi[45]
> Kai pōpolohua mea a Kāne[46]
> Inu a ka manu i ke kai ʻula
> I ke kai a ka ʻōmaʻomaʻo
> ʻAʻole kū, ʻaʻole hina, ʻaʻole moe
> ʻAʻole wawā loa kai a ke ana o Kū.[47]
>
> The sea resounds against the island
> The sea of glowing coals
> The purplish-blue, reddish-brown sea of Kāne
> The drinking of the bird in the red sea
> In the sea of green, the sea of ʻōmaʻo seaweed
> Not rising, not falling, not sleeping
> Not very noisy is the sea of the caverns of Kū.[48]

Notes:

1. It is possible that longer versions of these mele still exist in private collections or in as-yet-unsearchable issues of our nūpepa Hawaiʻi. Fornander complicates the search for older texts by not crediting his sources and by leaving the impression that he is the sole repository of these rare materials.

We have only recently become aware of Joseph Poepoe's indirect critique of Fornander's pretensions with regards to Paumakua: Poepoe notes that versions of Paumakua's genealogy had been published in *Ka Elele Hawaii* (Kamakau, 12-21-1865) and J. F. Pogue's *Ka Moolelo Hawaii* (Malo, 1858) well before Fornander's 1878 *Account*. Poepoe also names the haku mele of the Fornander fragment of "'O Paumakua" as Kaleikuahulu or Kalanikuahulu, and he provides us with lines from an additional mele koihonua for Paumakua composed by Kapa'ahulani in about 1565 in the time of Kūali'i: "Eia ka Kapaahulani mele koihonua i haku ai no Paumakua, i ke au ia Kualii, ke alii of Oahu nei; a o ka M.H. 1565 paha ia..." (J.M. Poepoe, "Moolelo Hawaii Kahiko, *Ka Nai Aupuni*, August 22 and 25, 1906). Our subsequent investigation of Kamakau's "Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I" (*Nupepa Kuokoa*, 12-29-1866) demonstrates that the Paumakua and Kaulu backstories that Fornander so stingily references were available in print, and in more detail – but not in English – a full decade before his publication of what has for too long been taken as the definitive account.

I first wrote this essay in 1983 for our presentation of these three mele in that year's Merrie Monarch Festival. I have since revised this piece to reflect my new understanding of the sources that pre-date Fornander and undermine his pākali handling of information. What this essay really needs, however, is a thorough re-writing – one that removes Fornander from his privileged and unearned position, one that acknowledges Poepoe's century-old critique of the ethnologist, and one that tells the story of our voyaging ancestors through older, 'ōiwi eyes.

2. Excerpt from "E Lonokaeho" in N.B. Emerson, *Papers of the Hawaiian Historical Society, No. 5*, "The Long Voyages of the Ancient Hawaiians," p. 10.

3. "Several lines of recent research raise questions about a simple two-migration sequence as the explanation for Hawaiian origins...Polynesians were not as isolated as scholars once believed...[and] continuing contact over much of the region would make a simple A to B to C sequence of settlement false. Island histories were no doubt replete with long distance contacts, trade, and secondary waves of migrants. The evidence supports our renewed sense of a complex settlement history – and thus multiple origins of Hawaiians within Polynesia." Terry L. Hunt in Silberman, *The Oxford Companion to Archaeology*, 1996, pps. 659-660.

4. Fornander, *Account*, II:23. Kuaaohe (Paumakua's birthplace) is a land division on the Mōkapu peninsula in what is today recognized as the 'ahupua'a of Kāne'ohe, We Kailua people, of course, will argue that Kuaaohe was once part of our own 'ahupua'a.

5. Ibid.

6. Thrum, *Fornander Collection*, 1916: 88-89.

7. ('')Auakahinu? ('')Auakamea? I apologize for the inconsistent orthography of these and other proper nouns in this essay. In general, I try to leave unfamiliar names unaltered (ie: I don't add 'okina and kahakō; I write them as they are given in original sources) except in our performance texts where orthographic decisions, however restrictive of possible meaning, are necessary because we are, in fact, pronouncing these names.

8. Fornander, *Account*, II:25.

9. Ibid.

10. Today, Olomana is the most prominent of the three Kailua peaks, Aniani is the ridge dividing Kailua from Waimānalo, and Holomakani is the heiau that overlooks Kawainui from above Nā Pōhaku o Hauwahine.

11. "He Moolelo o na Kamehameha," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 10-24-1868; poorly edited and translated in *Ruling Chiefs*, 325; accurately transcribed in *Ke Aupuni Mōʻī*, 100. Translation mine.

12. *Account*, II:26. I have also been able to locate the following summary of Paumakua's life written in response to the misconception that the first haole in Hawaiʻi were Kukanaloa and Kulou who arrived in the time of Umi's son Keinokaloa: "Ua ikeia paha ma ka moolelo Hawaii, aole o lakou na haole kahiko. I ka manawa ia Paumakua ke alii i holo i Kahiki, ua oleloia, ua lawe mua mai ka haole, eia o Kukahauula me Kukaiepa, a e ka wahine o Haina Pole. Ua oleloia nana i lawe mai i kanaka liilii. Ua loaa ka mimilo o Moananuikaioo. Ua lilo i kupuna no ka lahui." The article gives the same three names that Fornander attributes to the spurious Maui tradition, but it does not identify Paumakua as belonging to either the Puna or Hema lines. It lists Paumakua's other accomplishments as bringing the little people to Hawaiʻi (an opinion shared with Kamakau but attributed by Fornander to Paumakua's uncle), as encountering the maelstrom of Moananuikaioo, and as becoming an ancestor of our lāhui. Unfortunately, the author of this piece is not named. ("No ka minamina i ka Moolelo Hawaii no ka Nalowale," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, June 2, 1866.)

13. *Account*, I:104.

14. In David Malo, *Moolelo Hawaii*, 327.

15. *Account*, II:26.

16. This is a departure from the more familiar story of Laʻamaikahiki bringing the first pahu (ʻOpuku) to Hawaiʻi as told by Kamakau in "Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 1-12-1867 (also in Tatar, *Hula Pahu*, II:14). Tatar reminds us that Kamakau elsewhere identifies the pahu ʻOpuku and Hāwea as already present at Kūkaniloko in the time of Kapawa, a contemporary of Paumakua (*Hula Pahu*, II:17).

17. J.M. Poepoe, "Ka Moolelo Kaao o Hiiaka-i-ka-Poli-o-Pele," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, Feb. 21, 1908. "While Pele was sleeping, her spirit heard the sound of some actual hand-beaten pahu, that is to say, the pahu kāʻeke described in ancient times; and there also came with it the drawn-out sounds of the voices of hula. The sound of the drums resonated, and there also arose the tapping of the pūniu made joyful by the nīʻau [perhaps *nīʻau* is a reference to the kā with which the pūniu is tapped]… Right now, dear reader, the story of Paumakua will be spoken of; he was the aliʻi of Hawaiʻi who returned from the pillars of Kahiki and first brought the hula kāʻeke to Hawaiʻi nei. According to this section of the story of Hiʻiaka gotten from the Maui tellers of her story, it was quite some time ago that the hula kāʻeke reached Hawaiʻi. And if this is true, the first time it was made known in Hawaiʻi was when Paumakua arrived, the aliʻi about whom is said: ʻO Paumakua ka lani o Moenaimua / O ke aliʻi nāna i hele ke Kahiki…It was afterwards that Pele mā landed here in Hawaiʻi nei; Paumakua's return from Kahiki came first, in the era spoken of in Ka Moʻolelo Hawaiʻi [?], and it was Paumakua who brought the hula kāʻeke here" (Translation mine).

18. Poepoe, Feb. 28, 1908. "But it is seen in the old histories of Hawaiʻi nei that there were two Paumakua, namely those of Maui and Oahu, and as for these two, they are known in our Hawaiʻi's moʻolelo to have lived in the time of 1060 A.D. It is understood that these Paumakua came first and that Pele came much later…" (Translation mine).

19. Fornander's gloss of this line ("The gentle, the precious, the prosperous") concentrates on the meaning of *momi* as "precious, valuable" while ignoring completely the synonyms *mio* and *māmio*, both of which refer to movement that is swift and usually departing. I have thus provided what I think is a more accurate translation: "The swift-moving, the precious, the quickly-departing."

20. Text: Fornander, *Account*, II:25-26. Orthography and translation: Kīhei de Silva.

21. S.M. Kamakau, "Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 12-29-1866. Translation mine.

22. Ibid.

23. *Account*, II:12-13.

24. *Account*, II:45.

25. Martha Beckwith, *Hawaiian Mythology*, 439-440.

26. Sterling and Summers, *Sites of O'ahu*, 231-232.

27. Lahilahi Web in *Sites*, 232.

28. Mary Kawena Pukui, free translation of "History of Kamehameha," *Ka Nai Aupuni*, 9-4-1906, in *Sites*, 232.

29. Mrs. Charles Akiona, informant, 9-29-1939, in *Sites*, 232.

30. J.B. Keliikanakaole, "Moe Kaoo i ka Lepo," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 10-26-1872, p.2. Translation mine. Keliikanakaole's final query seems more facetious than sincere since he has just described the fish and food prosperity of Kailua, not its dearth.

31. S.M. Kamakau, "Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I," *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 12-29-1866. Translation mine.

32. Dole in *Hawaiian Club Papers*, Oct. 1868, 4-5. He cites Kamakau as his source but offers the following information independently of his source "the ancients possessed accounts of a large whirlpool which they called Moanawaikaioo, which was often alluded to in their traditions." Dole then changes its name to "the Maelstrom Waikaioo" without explanation.

33. *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 7-22-1866; in this case the adventure is attributed to Paumakua.

34. *Ke Aloha Aina*, 3-30-1912.

35. Beckwith, *Hawaiian Mythology*, 440. In the lagoon of Takarora, for example, "canoes are drawn [in], disappear from sight, and emerge again some distance beyond."

36. Fornander, *Collection,* IV: 522-533. V:364-371; summarized by Beckwith in *Hawaiian Mythology*, 436-437.

37. Beckwith, 436-441.

38. Kamakau summarizes these places as follows: “ua loaa kekahi mau aina o ka moana, ua loaa kekahi mau aina o Asia, a me Europa” – he reached some islands of the ocean, some lands of Asia, and some of Europe. “Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I,” *Nupepa Kuokoa*, 12-29-1866.

39. I can find no precedent for Fornander’s translation of this line (“Ka auwaalalua”) as “The sea-slug.” It makes more sense that the key word here is *‘auwa‘a-lā-lua*, defined by Pukui and Elbert as “fleet of canoes with two sails” (*Dictionary*, 33), and I have re-translated the line to reflect this definition.

40. The kīwa‘a is a mythical bird associated with overseas travel and “said to be the pilot bird which conducts the navigator in to the canoe shed at the landing place” (Beckwith, *Hawaiian Mythology*, 91). The feathers of the birds Halulu and Kīwa‘a “were said to rise and fall on the heads of images in answer to a kahuna’s petitions” (Beckwith, 92). Kamakau notes that the feathers of Kūka‘ilimoku came from the foreheads of these two mythical birds: “He akua hulu o Kukailimoku; a ua olelo ia no hoi oia na hulu i ka lae o ka manu nui o Halulu a me Kiwaa” (“Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I,” *Nupepa Kuokoa*, July 6, 1867).

41. Text: Fornander, *Account*, 11:13-15. Translation: Kīhei de Silva (based on Fornander with modifications). Orthography: Kīhei de Silva.

42. “Ka Moolelo o Lonoikamakahiki,” *Ke Au Okoa*, September 18, 1865. The following lines are chanted by Lonoikamakahiki when he removes the iwi of his grandfather from his calabash-container:

Kai wawa ka moku kai nanahu ahi,
Kai popolohua mea a Kane,
Inu a ka manu i ke kai a ka omaomao
Kai omaomao
E-le-ku, elehiwa, elemoe
Ele wawa loa kai a ka Makalii.

43. S.M. Kamakau, “Ka Moolelo o Kamehameha I,” *Nupepa Kuokoa*, December 22, 1866. Kamakau introduces the mele fragment with this explanation: “Eia kekahi mea kupanaha i ka poe kahiko ma Hawaii nei, ua paa naau loa ka mimilo o Norewai, ua kapaia o ka mimilo o Manawaikaioo [sic]. Ua loaa pinepine maloko o na kaao a me na mele a ka poe kahiko. O ke kaieleele, ke kaiomaomao, me ke kai ula, ua loaa no ia ka poe kahiko. Penei kekahi mele kahiko: Kai wawa ka moku / Kai lanahu ahi…” “Here is something amazing about the people of old in Hawai‘i nei, they were well aware of the maelstrom of Norway which is called the whirlpool of Manawaikaioo. This appears frequently in the stories and chants of the po‘e kahiko. And as for the Black Sea, the Green Sea, and the Red Sea, these too were known to the old ones, as is shown in this ancient mele: Kai wawā ka moku / Kai lānahu ahi…” (Translation mine.)

44. *Account*, II:15.

45. The Andrews’ dictionary defines *kailanahuahi* (also *kainanahuahi*) as “very dark or black water of the ocean,” 233. Harold Kent’s *Treasury of Hawaiian Words* offers the similar, “very dark or blue water of the ocean,” 254. The term appears, most recently, in Dennis Kamakahi’s description of the Ka‘ulakahi Channel between Kaua‘i and Ni‘ihau in his mele “Kaua‘i o Mano” (on the CD *Pua ‘Ena*): “‘O Ni‘ihau ho‘i ku‘u lei aloha lā / I ke kai lānahu ahi o Ka’ulakahi.”

46. Fornander’s translation of this line (“The *azure blue* sea of Kane”) does not do justice to the complexity of color and shade in the Hawaiian *pōpolohua mea*.

47. Fornander renders this last line as "Aole wawa loa kai a *ke ana oku* – Never very noisy is the sea of *sacred caves*." The possible meanings of *oku* (*ʻōkū*: erect, protrude, emerge; thunderstruck, taken aback, horrified") do not suggestion anything "sacred." *O Kū*, on the other hand, contains both sacredness and balance (it pairs nicely with *Kāne* of line 3). I have, therefore, ventured to retranslate the concluding line of our mele as "Not very noisy is the sea of the caverns of Kū."

I have only recently discovered that *Ke ana o Kū* is identified in the 1911 and 1870 versions of the moʻolelo of the shark-child Ka-eha-iki-mano-o-Puuloa as the Kaʻula-island residence of the enormous shark-chief Kūhaimoana: "Oia ka inoa o ka hale alii o ua Kuhaimoana ala i ka moku o Kaula ma kaulana a ka la" – [Ke Ana o Kū] is the name of the hale aliʻi of the aforementioned Kūhaimoana at the island of Kaʻula where the sun comes to rest (Ka Ohu Haaheo i na Kuahiwi, "He Moolelo Kaili Puuwai no Kaehaiki-Mano-o-Puuloa…,"*Ke Au Hou*, January 4, 1911, translation mine). "He ana nui keia, oia ka halealii o ua aiwaiwa nei o ka moana ma kaulana a ka la" – It is a big cave and the palace of the aforementioned awesome one of the ocean at the setting place of the sun (Henry Uaua, Esq., "He Moolelo Kaao no Kaehuikimanoopuuloa…," *Ke Au Okoa*, December 22, 1870, translation mine).

48. Text: Fornander, *Account*, II:15. Orthographic editing and translation: Kīhei de Silva.

This essay was first published in Hālau Mōhala ʻIlima's 2016 Merrie Monarch Fact Sheet.
It is offered here in revised and updated form.